A DIFFERENT TYPE OF RESILIENCE:
A PARADIGM SHIFT FOR SMALL POST-INDUSTRIAL COMMUNITIES

A Thesis
Submitted to the
Faculty of Miami University
In partial fulfillment of
The requirements for the degree of
Master of Architecture
Department of Architecture and Interior Design
By
TERRI LYNN WOLFE
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio
2017

Advisor____________________________________
(Thomas Dutton)

Reader____________________________________
(Gerardo Brown-Manrique)

Consultant____________________________________
(John Becker)

Consultant____________________________________
(Diane Fellows)
A Different Type of Resilience: A Paradigm Shift for Small Post-Industrial Communities

Terri Lynn Wolfe
Miami University

ABSTRACT

Resilience is a term often used in design to refer to natural disaster relief through architectural practices. Yet, a new form of resilience could potentially serve as a paradigm shift for those cities and towns seeking economic relief. In the small post-industrial town of Steubenville, Ohio, we find a community that’s struggled to reassert its identity in the face of its raw economic decline. Therefore, an economic resilience must be implemented that empowers that town to reinvent itself and to thrive as it once did during its 1940s Industrial heyday. Can economic resilience become the new solution for small town planning? Dilapidated, abandoned buildings and rubble-filled lots remain as reminders that haunt downtown Steubenville. How do we restore the sense of community among residents as well as bring about the economic stability that the town once enjoyed? Historically, the Ohio River served as a key source of the town’s economic prosperity. The catalyst for Steubenville’s renewal may lie in the coupling of this noble natural resource and the implementation of economic resilience. This endeavor could introduce a paradigm shift for Steubenville using approaches taken by other small and struggling, post-industrial cities.

Research has been comprised by interviews with city leaders, business owners and residents, embedded research, and analysis via case studies such as Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania and Roseburg, Oregon. Peering through the lens of Steubenville’s once-flourishing industrial history, cross-temporal connections begin to reveal viable clues that indicate a more community-centered downtown that can be re-activated, re-engaged, and re-invigorated as well as sustained for future generations.

Key Words: Resilience, economic resilience, small towns, waterfront, post-industrialism

INTRODUCTION

“I don’t want to stay in this town, I can’t wait to get out. There is just nothing for me and my future here”. Mom and Dad sat quietly with their arms crossed and their faces wrinkled with confusion as we sat around the kitchen table discussing college plans and the future that lies ahead- my future. Why did they not understand that I had no desire to stay in this town? Did they not realize that my future opportunities are limited in a small town like this? There is simply nothing that is holding me here. I can’t wait to get out of the town that I once loved and move on to bigger and better things with my life.

This is a memory that I can vividly recall as my seventeen-year-old self was preparing to apply for college. Perhaps the real question is- why did I not want to stay? What made the small town of Steubenville, Ohio such an undesirable place to live for a seventeen-year-old high school graduate preparing for the next chapter in her life? As a child growing up in the small town along the Ohio River, I have no recollections of participating in community events such as festivals, parades, community gatherings, playing at community parks, or even going to a farmer’s market on a Saturday morning with my parents. I have no memory of having a sense of community in my hometown that I thought meant so much to me growing up. Perhaps the lack of community and social interaction was due to the town’s progressive declination. Decline, this is what I remember.

Every town, large or small, has a historic beginning, which once defined the town as a
whole and gave it its thriving unique identity; this identity began in the heart of the city, the downtown. It has always been said that home is where the heart is, but without a heartbeat left in the downtown, then there is no longer a sense of home. With no heartbeat, there is no life. However, a defibrillator has the power to bring that heartbeat back to a steady pulse, giving new life to a soul that was almost lost.

Steubenville, a post-industrial rust belt city and former steel town, was once a town with a population of 40,000 in the 1940s. According to the United States Census Bureau, as of 2015 this population has dwindled to a scarce 18,000. Steel and coal were the primary industries that led Steubenville to its economic success, as well as other smaller industries such as local paper mills, glass factories, and nail factories. Unfortunately, during the 1970s and 1980s, most of the smaller industries had shut down. Eventually, in 2005 one of the two main steel mills closed its doors. The second mill is still in operation today but employs less than 1,200 people. Most of the mill has been torn down and used as scrap yards. These factories and establishments are now nothing but memories of what once was the thriving city of Steubenville, Ohio.

Dilapidated and abandoned buildings along with rubble filled lots are left behind and haunt the downtown area of Steubenville. How do we bring back the sense of community as well as bring about the economic stability that Steubenville once had? How do we bring resilience to a small town that has immeasurably felt the effects of post-industrialism? This paper explores the idea of resilience and how it can be applied to small town planning. Resilience in the general sense is the ability to recover from some sort of difficulty or hardship. Resilience is also a term used in architectural design. In design, resilience can often be defined as the intentional design relief as a result of natural disasters such as hurricanes, earthquakes, tornadoes, and wildfires. A combination of the general and design definition has the potential to create a new type of resilience. Steubenville has undergone its own unique type of disaster – an economic disaster. Therefore, an economic resilience must be achieved in order for the town to be re-invented. This type of resilience will allow the town of Steubenville, Ohio to thrive as it once did.

Through the investigation of Steubenville’s flourishing industrial history and by seeking why the town has seen a decline in recent years, connections will be made to how Steubenville can be reinvented through resilience to bring about a more interactive and community-centered downtown atmosphere, much like its past. This investigation allows me to understand what the city used to be in the time when the steel and coal industries were thriving and people crowded the downtown area.

As a result of creating economic resilience, the small town of Steubenville will finally experience what it means to have a sense of place in the downtown area. By using the overall potential of the downtowns current vacant lots as well as using the town’s natural assets such as the Ohio River, Steubenville will be able to reconnect back to its thriving community. Can economic resilience become the paradigm shift for small town planning?

With the exploration and comparisons of case studies of various scales, similarities and differences will become pertinent of what large and small cities have to offer. Case studies include waterfront development practices in Roseburg, Oregon along the South Umpqua River. Roseburg is similar in size to Steubenville, which is located along the Ohio River at the Eastern part of Ohio. Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, on the other hand, sits on a much larger scale than Roseburg but is similar to Steubenville being located along the Ohio River and sharing the same industrial past. By comparing these two separate demographic areas, possibilities for successful downtown revitalization efforts for Steubenville, Ohio can be developed.

Successful downtown development using natural assets is key to recreating livable communities in small towns. Perhaps the reason I have been driven away from my hometown is
due to the fact that I do not feel a sense of place- a key component to successful downtown development. In recent years, the focus for small town planning is now geared toward social and community based developments, especially in towns where the lack of community exists.

All cities have a historic beginning and a timeline to its declination; the downtown was the centroid of this beginning. The downtown area sits at the heart of what the city once was, where it is now only a distant memory. Because it is the people that live in Steubenville who evoke the strongest feelings about the town, interviews with Steubenville city leaders and planners, business owners and residents of a variety of generations is a focal point of my research. Although I have my own views about Steubenville, standing on the streets of the town evokes the true image of the city from my eyes. My research is not only based on my personal experience of the town growing up but on the personal experiences of those who live there as well- those who have lived there for a few short years to sixty years have different views and different experiences.

These interviews will engage the stakeholders of Steubenville, understanding their views of the town, what they think it needs, what they think it lacks, and what plans have been implemented by city leaders and planners. How did these efforts fare? How can Steubenville awaken the liveliness that it once had? These are the people that want to see the town get back to its thriving downtown atmosphere- to evoke new life! Sean Creegan, lifetime Steubenville resident and business owner for forty-years, stated in an interview discussing the current quality of the downtown,

“I remember what it used to be like. I was a business owner in the downtown from the good to the bad and I truly miss the way it used to be, so full of life and excitement. Now it is just a disgrace. […] Everyone thought the steel industry would last. Pittsburgh was able to get over the fall of the industry; they were able to reinvent themselves. How do we reinvent ourselves?”

Speaking with a variety of generations allows for a broad spectrum of experiences and perspectives. Each generation has a story to tell about their hometown, and everyone has memories of their own. Those who have lived there all of their life may feel more passionate about the town as it once was. On the other hand, the younger generations, like myself, may feel a need to seek cities elsewhere to fulfill their educational and future career needs. What is going to make the younger generation stay while also satisfying the needs of those who have lived there through the town’s decline?

Unfortunately, what we have seen is that smaller cities are losing the skilled younger generation to larger cities that are able to fulfill their needs of the work, play, and live lifestyle. The younger generations do not feel a need to stay in a town that does not give them the opportunities they need in order to live a successful and interactive life. Steubenville is a town that does not fulfill these needs, and in response, this generation of people seek larger cities, like Pittsburgh (approximately 40 miles from Steubenville), that are filled with excitement and endless opportunities. Bill Mitchell notes in his article, No-Fools Paradise, cities providing public spaces to encourage interaction by creating an effective live-work environment while also focusing on the high quality of life overall attract these generations.

The building scale of small towns is about a human scale of one to two story buildings rather than high-rises that stand hundreds of feet tall. Architecture at a human scale begins to formulate personal relationships with those who inhabit and interact with the built environment. Usable downtown open spaces, like the abandoned buildings and rubble filled lots, leave infinite possibilities for community activities- an aspect that my childhood and the town of Steubenville lacked when I was growing up. Public spaces should be inviting and place making is important to successful downtown revitalization, “Successful downtowns are places where care has been taken in the redevelopment of the public spaces, where attention has been paid to the details of design.”
Author and urban planner Michael Burayidi writes in *Resilient Downtowns of Small Urban Communities* "Without a downtown, there is no gathering spot, no togetherness, and each one is left on their own". Creating a focal point and providing gathering spaces may bring the community together. Downtown revitalization may be thought of as the art of transforming public spaces into quality environments. Downtowns should be resilient as Michael Burayidi notes, the downtown should be a vibrant place where people do their daily activities like work, play, eat, and live. So I ask: Can creating a sense of place in post-industrial downtown areas help create resilience in small town communities? Referring back to the interview with Mr. Sean Creegan, how do post-industrial towns re-invent themselves to a future of new opportunities while also honoring the town’s past?

**STEUBENVILLE’S INDUSTRIAL PAST**

In the mid 1800’s to later 1900’s, The Ohio Valley region thrived on many manufacturing industries. These industries included coal, iron, lead, and salt. The Ohio river, which stretches 981 miles and flows through six states including Illinois, Indiana, Kentucky, Pennsylvania, West Virginia, and of course, Ohio, served as a beneficial asset to Ohio’s manufacturing success. Steubenville, a typical example of a now post-industrial rust belt city, was once a melting pot for many of these industries. Predominately recognized for steel and coal, Steubenville was also a producer of paper, glass, pottery, and nails. Being located only 40 miles down the river from Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, Steubenville served as a connecting branch for manufacturing purposes. The river also served as the location where early homes and businesses were formulated. While these industries thrived, so did the population. Steubenville continued to see growth up until the late 1950’s; however, this is where the significant reverse began.

**SMALL TOWN CHARACTERISTICS**

"Here in the city the goods of civilization are multiplied and manifolded; here is where human experience is transformed into viable signs, symbols, patterns of conduct, systems of order; here is where the issues of civilization are focused; here, too, ritual passes on occasion into the active drama of a fully differentiated and self-conscious society."

-Lewis Mumford

Finding identity in a town is crucial especially in small towns where people usually seem to value this aspect of community and identity. Identity is what makes small towns different from those cities on a larger scale. I find it hard to believe that a city of a few million, or even a few couple hundred thousand for that matter, can successfully find a sense of community aside from their fast paced lives. There are questions that still linger: Why do people like small towns? What is it about them that people like? There are certain qualities about the atmosphere of small towns that make people feel comfortable and protected. Each town has the ability to form its own unique identity; this is what makes it different from every other town in the world. This unique identity must be revealed and used to its full potential. In *Small Town America*, author Robert Wuthnow describes the relationship to one’s hometown as a connection between place and spirit. This is what creates one’s deep roots and passions to the city in which one lives, in this case, one’s hometown.

It is also arguable that small towns are the essential ideal place to raise children. A small town to a family usually promotes the notion of freedom for children that evoke curiosity and play-aspects that are essential for child development. This usually includes a mid-sized home with a front and backyard with grass and trees. Even outside of the neighborhood atmosphere, these ideal places to raise a family will also promote community interaction with open spaces and inviting parks and recreational areas. These spaces are usually where the community gathers for events and festivals.

Wuthnow also discusses the idea that although small towns are the ideal place to raise a family, parents ultimately raise their children in these towns just to essentially train them to leave. Parents and guardians want their children to move on to bigger and better places with infinite opportunities. Why can’t their small hometown
provide these bigger and better opportunities that their parents wish for them? Perhaps small towns lack the necessary components to function as a successful community. Having a sense of community in small towns is what makes them so desirable, but the lack thereof is what makes people want to leave. Wuthnow's concluding comments suggests building blocks must exist for communities in order for small towns to be successful. In Figure 1, Wuthnow describes that the spirit of the community is the center of many connecting elements work in sync to give communities their unique identity.21

Pittsburgh was indeed effected by the industrial economic fall, thus it had become a victim of yet, again, another rusted city. Since then, Pittsburgh has made many successful efforts in attempt to revitalize the city by bringing about new optimism through creativity.22 Through the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust, the group implemented civic and cultural amenities to the downtown region that had been mostly deteriorated by the effects of post-industrialism.

The idea behind the revitalization effort was to add to the quality of life for the residents while also attracting visitors and tourists to the city. The Partners for Livable Communities suggests that by using the amenities approach, cities that invest in the cultural and natural assets have a better and more successful chance of attracting tourists and businesses to the area.23 This also creates a more enjoyable and entertaining environment for the residents of Pittsburgh as well as the surrounding areas. Since these amenities have been implemented, Pittsburgh has brought about many new attractions to the downtown area. One of the many new ideas has been the revitalization of the riverfront along the Ohio and Allegheny River. This effort has been greatly supported by the community members because it creates community interaction along the beautiful riverfronts. These plans consist of new transportation infrastructure, riverfront amenities and walking trails, new housing developments, and other necessary business and civic developments. These plans also involve the promotion of the redevelopment of the existing streetscapes that connect planners and developers directly to the riverfront, which ultimately increases community interaction.24

According to the article, Professional Practice: Healthy and Livable Communities, published by The American Society of Landscape Architects, the article discusses how the lack of environmental spaces and green infrastructure can quickly help with the depletion of rural areas in economically depressed cities. Green community spaces help to promote a healthy and livable community by encouraging members to use the facilities for outdoor exercising, de-stressing, and much needed community interaction such as farmers markets.
selling locally produced foods and community gardens. On the other hand, Kathleen Wolf and Katrina Flora take a more medical approach to environmental design in their article, Mental Health & Function. The article expresses the positive effects that environmental design can have on the brain and everyday functions. From a medical standpoint, natural surroundings can decrease tension levels, calm the brain from daily mental fatigue, de-stress after a long demanding work or school day, encourage social interaction, help with mental stress and illness, and promote outdoor physical activity. Wolf and Flora’s article displays and proves the positive effects of eco-therapy in children, adults, and the elderly can lead to positive mental health and brain activity. Landscape sculptor and designer Maya Lin establishes a sense of community in downtown areas through sculptural expressions. She uses her sculptural techniques to enhance community revitalization and sees these sculptural landscape parks as a chance to draw people in and therefore encourage interaction. Using parks as a work of art can act as a focal point for community interaction. Creating a linked system of parks and open space in the urban fabric can be thought of as the way that the body functions as specified by Patrick Condon in his publication of Seven Rules for Sustainable Communities- Design Strategies for the Post-Carbon World. Condon uses an analogy in which he describes that revitalization efforts should be a system that works with, and not against nature, “The site is to the region as the cell is to the body; just as the health of the individual human cell has everything to do with the health of the human body, so too does the ecological function of the individual site have everything to do with the ecological health of the region”. The problem with post-industrial rust belt cities, like Steubenville, is that the idea of greening the city, especially the downtown region, is fairly difficult. Joseph Schilling and Jonathan Logan express in their publication Greening the Rustbelt, that urban shrinkage is not a new idea by any means. This urban shrinkage in small towns is usually connected to larger industrial cities that have also seen a decline. This is also the case with Steubenville in the sense that as Pittsburgh began to see its industrial decline, so did Steubenville. Ultimately, as towns start to decline, the amount of abandoned units and vacant lots seem to increase drastically. These vacant lots and abandoned units can serve as great potential for revitalization efforts as well as community developments. Schilling and Logan also express that using natural assets such as rivers create great opportunities for waterfront developments allowing for place making at the water’s edge where community gathering and amenities can take place. These types of amenities at the water’s edge can create a great opportunity to make connections with new revitalization efforts and developments at the downtown area. Aside from the amenities approach, Elizabeth A. Duke takes a more holistic approach to design when it comes to community revitalization and development as specified in her publication, What Works for America. She suggests community development should not only be for the people, but for the places as well. By using a holistic approach, it is essential to consider the needs of both people and place for a stronger, more resilient community. This is a comprehensive strategy that should be implied to achieve overall community development. Working together with using the amenities approach and holistic approach can create what small town’s need- the experience of place.

WATERFRONT DEVELOPMENT

Throughout America’s pastime, waterfront developments have proven to serve many cities as a key to economic growth. For many centuries before roadways and vehicles, rivers served as the main link to cities around the world. During the industrial era, rivers were a beneficial asset by means of transportation of products for factories and mills. Unfortunately, as the industrial revolution started to decline, so did the need for the river. Shortly after this decline, river communities around the world began to realize that the use of the waterfront was going to waste. City leaders, planners, and residents of these communities quickly set out to reactivate the waterfront to what it once was- the image of the city.
Eventually, it was evident that not only did waterfront development, especially in small towns, promote open/green spaces, public spaces, office, retail, and housing developments, but it also created a catalyst for redevelopment in the downtown area. By reactivating the waterfront and promoting development, this is a great way to bring consumers down to the water’s edge while also enjoying beautiful views. This is what ultimately creates the overall vision, having the opportunity to work, live, play, and eat while being surrounded by natural man-made environments. Not only does it create the overall vision, but also creates the sense of place and identity towns strive for.

For many towns, large or small, the river serves as the gateway to the city. At the water’s edge is where the true identity of the city is revealed and for economically depressed towns, waterfront development can create the momentum that these towns need in order to create life and prosperity. For small towns, riverfront development can play a major role in reconnecting city centers while also creating economic and social well-being as well as creating beauty, vitality, and cultural stimulus at the water’s edge.32

CASE STUDIES

The following large and small scale case studies provide an outline for post-industrial town revitalization as well as waterfront developments for towns seeking economic relief. In contrast to the poor education facility outside of Cincinnati, Ohio previously mentioned in the text. These case studies set the stage for the future development of Steubenville by implementing some of the design tactics applied in these towns.

PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA

Allegheny Waterfront Development

Population: 305,000

Throughout the 21st century, Pittsburgh has been making great strides to improving the city as a whole after recovering from the effects of the Rust Belt. One of the many improvements to the city is the revitalization of the Allegheny Riverfront; this is an aspect that is strongly approved by the community members of the city of Pittsburgh. The master plan for Green Boulevard is to create a 6.5-mile urban plan to not only revitalize and activate the riverfront, but to improve the overall quality of community culture by creating housing, business development and many other strategies that encourages economic development. The 6.5-mile master plan makes key connections to the downtown area, the Strip District, Lawrenceville, and Highland Park. The 6.5-mile site is also situated at four major access points from across the Allegheny River that connect directly to the Strip District, Lawrenceville, and Highland Park. With this new master plan, Pittsburgh is turning its old problems into new opportunities for the community by supporting new public infrastructure and community interaction by using destination points along the Allegheny River, which is ultimately making Pittsburgh and even more livable place to live. The overall plan is to create public outreach, transportation improvements, new riverfronts, and housing as well as other necessary

Figure 2. © Overall Allegheny Riverfront vision location in relation to Pittsburgh.
developments. Along with the riverfront, this plan also promotes the redevelopment of existing streets; from here planners and developers have made connections directly to the riverfront, which will ultimately increase community interaction. \(^3^3\)

**ROSEBURG, OREGON**

Waterfront Master Plan Development

Population: 21,000

![Figure 3. © Overall waterfront master plan development area of study for Roseburg.](image)

In 2010, the city of Roseburg, Oregon implemented their waterfront development master plan. As a city of approximately 21,000 people and being located along the South Umpqua River, city planners realized that the river should serve as the front door to the city. In an effort to reconnect the community to the city, the river served as a great resource for Roseburg. By using the combination of natural and urban areas along the river to connect to the downtown, economic development within the city will increase. It was evident that the river served as a natural amenity that should be used to create social as well as recreational opportunities at the water’s edge. With the development of a waterfront, the city recognized that tourism, property values, quality of life, and amenities for residents would be greatly increased. Some of the key elements applied in the overall master plan included redevelopment investments, a balance between open spaces and developments, a connection between the waterfront and the downtown, and take advantage of vacant lots and rundown properties in the city as well as along the river. With this master plan development, the city of Roseburg plans to reveal a unique identity. City planners created a flexible plan that encourages investment opportunities that consists of a variety of projects (incremental approach) that builds an overall momentum by creating destinations along the riverfront and through the town. \(^3^4\)

**CONCLUSION**

For many cities large and small, being located along a body of water continues to prove that this natural asset creates hubs for economic, cultural, and social activities. However, during the post-industrial era, American cities seemed to turn their back on the river as industries depleted. Today, these rivers represent exponential economic growth to many deprived cities. It was once that the city depended on its body of water to fulfill industrial transportation needs, but now, it is dependent on the source of life and prosperity that the natural asset brings. Through effective research, case studies, and interviews with local city leaders, business owners, and residents it is evident that waterfront development in economically depressed towns prove to build overall momentum for other positive developments. Starting at the water’s edge, this momentum stretches into the downtown and helps to reconnect the city center to its riverfront. By using the power of natural assets as a catalyst for growth, economic resilience will serve as the paradigm shift that small post-industrial cities need. As history has proven, there will always be an unbreakable bond between a city and its river.
REFERENCES


The town, once known as “Boomtown” and “Little Chicago” is now the ghost of what once was a thriving industrial city. Steubenville’s primary industrial past included the steel and coal industries. Two steel mills in the area were the prime reason for the town’s exponential economic growth: Weirton Steel Corporation and Wheeling-Pittsburgh Steel, which at one point was the 8th largest steel production company in the nation.


5 Merriam-Webster, Resilience Definition, Accessed July 20, 2016

http://www.resilientdesign.org


9 Bill Mitchell, No Fools Paradise last modified January 27, 2004
http://www.bdonline.co.uk/no-fools-paradise/3031420.article

10 Michael A. Burayidi, Resilient Downtowns of Small Urban Communities (Taylor and Francis 2013) 146.

11 Ibid, 1.
12 Ibid, 47.


14 “Steubenville History”

15 Jeffrey Darbee and Nancy Recchie, Steubenville Historic Contexts and Resource Evaluation (Benjamin D. Rickey and Co., Columbus, Ohio) 11-15.


17 Robert Wuthnow, Small Town America (Princeton University Press 2013) 53.

18 Ibid, 65.

19 Robert Wuthnow, 319.

20 Ibid, Original image found ion "Small-Town America", 342.

21 Ibid, 342-343.


23 Ibid, 130.

24 Urban Redevelopment Authority “Green Boulevard Strategic Plan” accessed March 12, 2016, http://ura.org/pdfs/ARGB/2013.03.21_ARGB-Executive-Summary.pdf


27 Partners for Livable Communities, 134.


29 Joseph Schilling and Jonathan Logan, Greening the Rustbelt (American Planning Association, Chicago, IL 2008) 452.

30 Joseph Schilling and Jonathan Logan, 454.


BIBLIOGRAPHY

Figure 1. © Terri Lynn Wolfe, 2016. Original image found in Robert Wuthnow, “Small Town America”.

Figure 2. © Terri Lynn Wolfe, 2016. Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.Original image from Google Earth.

Figure 3. © Terri Lynn Wolfe, 2016. Roseburg, Oregon. Original image from Google Earth.
Addendum
Terri Lynn Wolfe
Miami University

WRITTEN THESIS TO DESIGN TRANSITION

In my original thesis paper and even design intentions, the main focus had been the riverfront and how this asset could be used as a catalyst for new growth and prosperity for downtown Steubenville. In my final design, there is certainly a disconnect with this because my thesis design project became much more than riverfront development. Unfortunately, through the design process, it became evident that this was not the only way that Steubenville was going to be revitalized to what it once was in its industrial heyday. With that in mind, the design process took on an urban master planning route - which was certainly for the better. Instead of picking one specific site to be developed (as per the thesis design guidelines) I have proposed a new urban master plan for downtown Steubenville which would eventually lead to growth along the riverfront in hopes that this development would become a new urban edge for the downtown- and the river being at its front door.

ORIGINAL THESIS STATEMENT VS REVISED STATEMENT

Economic adversity has impacted a wide range of post-industrial cities throughout the Northeast and Great Lakes Region. Steubenville, Ohio, a mid-sized, former manufacturing hub must seek to empower the use of its existing assets (through urbanism, planning, and architecture) as a catalyst for new growth and economic resilience that will serve as a transformative paradigm shift for the downtown and the community.

DESIGN REVIEW REFLECTION

Overall, I was slightly pleased with the final review and the critics that participated. All critics gave valuable feedback. One of the main issues was at the riverfront. Unfortunately, I ran out of time in the design process to actually design the riverfront (which I would have loved to have done). In the overall master plan (diagrammatical), I proposed many connectors from my urban infill proposal to the riverfront. Some of these connections would lead to a future river park plaza and a new theater as main destinations. With that being said, I think the critics would have liked to have seen the riverfront plan implemented into the design, rather than being diagrammatical connectors.

I believe some of the critics did not agree with the process that I had taken- starting with Market Street infill plan and ending with my site of “The Steuben Center”. One critic asked why I had not started with the site- the simple answer to this is because I did not start with that site in the overall process. I presented my final thesis project as the process that I had took with the phases that I found to be realistic for downtown Steubenville.

CONCLUSION

This entire thesis process has certainly made me much stronger as a designer- being able to open my mind to many other things besides architecture. Through this design process, I
have really enjoyed that my project took on an urban master planning route and I hope to take this experience into the real world to use as an asset for my architectural design background.

Although I did not complete everything that I would have liked to have done with my final thesis, I am overall pleased with the outcome and how far the project had come—originally starting as a riverfront master plan project, to an urban master plan of the entire downtown.

SPECIAL THANKS

I would like to give a special thanks to all of my committee members—Tom Dutton, Gerardo Brown-Manrique, John Becker, and Diane Fellows. You all have been so important to me in this entire process and I cannot thank you all enough for your support. From the beginning of the research and writing process to the final presentation you all have been there for me when I needed you—even through the laughs and tears.

A thanks to Diane Fellows for being at the start of the thesis process and encouraging me to not only find myself through writing, but to also break out of my comfort zone.

A special thanks to Tom Dutton and Gerardo Brown-Manrique as being the dynamic urban planning chair-reader duo. I have learned so much from the both of you throughout this entire process.

An additional thanks to the 701 and 702 studio professors—John Becker and Dick Overton. I have learned more from the both of you than I have during my entire architectural education. Thank you both for pushing me and more importantly, for putting up with me throughout this process.

A thanks to my family who have been extremely supportive of me though the laughs and tears. I would not have been able to do this without your love and continuous support.

Last but not least, an extremely huge thank you to the M. ARCH class of 2017 (aka my buddies).
INITIAL PROCESS
A Different Type of Resilience: A Paradigm Shift for Small Post-Industrial Communities
PAPER PRESENTATIONS
Identity? Symposium Photographs
Hometown Influence:

Being born and raised in Steubenville, Ohio I obviously have a passion for the place where I grew up. Steubenville will always be home but when originally thinking about what I could do my thesis research on, I heavily reflected on the place that I grew up and loved. Steubenville was a town with so much life and prosperity back in its industrial heyday and I knew that one day I was going to have to move away in order to provide myself with a stable career. This is where my thesis has stemmed. I knew that something had to be done in Steubenville in order to revive a town that once thrived- and downtown is where this change needed to be.

Undergraduate Influence:

During my time at Fairmont State University, I had the opportunity to participate in the Community Design Assistance Center where I learned of my passion to design for the community and more importantly, what my values are when it comes to design. CDAC is a non-profit student group that worked directly with the city of Fairmont, WV as well as surrounding areas. This had a major influence on my thesis topic and overall design.

Original Thesis Statement:

Steubenville, Ohio, a mid-sized, former manufacturing hub must seek to empower the use of its natural assets (such as the Ohio River) as a catalyst for new growth and economic resilience that will serve as a transformative paradigm shift for the community.
SITE LOCATION
Steubenville, Ohio [Downtown]

NARRATIVE
There’s more to a city that meets the eye. The ability to grow, the ability to adapt, and the ability to prosper. All of these things frame our past, constantly changing before our eyes, shaping the way we envision the new— for the what can be and for the what will be. This is what defines a city, a community, a destination that distills the essence of what that city, community or destination truly is. What makes it special, what makes it unique. It’s the power of the place that defines who we are as humans, who we want to become and how this shapes our future. It’s the moving parts that work together to create an experience. It’s the fluidity of people— the movement of ideas that sparks the curiosity. It’s the articulation of the unique characteristics that makes a place and how we engage with the characteristics of detail— with the moments of life, with the faces, with the experiences. It’s the experience as a whole that creates the vision and it’s the layers of a city that creates a sense of place down to the slightest of details. The layers of a city work as a living organism— each one unique in its own. It’s the inherent strengths and characteristics— It’s the experiences, the culture, the people, the layers that enhance such a place. It’s not only about the make-up of the city, it’s the energy that a person feels within the place— whether you’re a tourist, resident or visitor of the destination. The people are very much a part of the place and the place is embedded in the person. It becomes a part of who they are and who they will become. It’s the commonality of people, the community, the architecture, the infrastructure, the tourists, the mix of cultures that create a bold message to the entire world of its true identity.
**Jefferson County, Ohio**  
*Population Decline* Age 25 - 29 Years

**Steubenville, Ohio**  
*Population decline: 1940 - 2010*

---

**Steubenville, Ohio**  
*Demographics overview*

- **Population**
  - Males: [55.8%](#)
  - Females: [44.2%](#)

- **Median Resident Age**
  - Steubenville: [40.4 years](#)
  - Ohio: [39.3 years](#)

- **Median Household Income**
  - Steubenville: $29,272
  - Ohio: $48,081

- **Median Household Value**
  - Steubenville: $90,708
  - Ohio: $127,000

---

**Jefferson County, Ohio**  
*Community Profile*

- **Population**

![Population graph](image)

- **Age Distribution**

![Age distribution pie chart](image)

- **Comparison Cities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>2010 Population</th>
<th>Population of Surrounding MSA</th>
<th>% College Enrolled (age 18 - 24)</th>
<th>% Minority</th>
<th>Median Household Income</th>
<th>Manufacturing Share of Total Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Steubenville, Ohio</td>
<td>18,659</td>
<td>120,929</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
<td>22.6%</td>
<td>$31,982</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown, Ohio</td>
<td>66,982</td>
<td>565,773</td>
<td>34.15</td>
<td>56.8%</td>
<td>$23,761</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allentown, Pennsylvania</td>
<td>118,032</td>
<td>821,623</td>
<td>27.7%</td>
<td>56.8%</td>
<td>$32,192</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wheeling, West Virginia</td>
<td>28,486</td>
<td>144,637</td>
<td>24.8%</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>$34,576</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data from Steubenville Comprehensive Plan
Steubenville, Ohio is located along the Ohio River and is approximately 40 miles from Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. With a current population of 18,000, Steubenville is bound by other towns such as Toronto, Ohio to the North, Wintersville, Ohio to the West and isolated across the Ohio River is Weirton, West Virginia to the Northeast and Follansbee, West Virginia to the East.

Steubenville, Ohio is a Post-Industrial rust-belt town that was once thriving with 35,000 people in the 1950s in its industrial heyday, predominately with the production of steel but also in other smaller industries such as coal, glass, nails, pottery, and paper. Since the decline of the steel industry, the population has decreased to 18,000 and the integrity of the downtown is quickly depleting. For that reason, the focus area for this thesis is the downtown of Steubenville, utilizing the Ohio River as a catalyst for growth in order to boost economic development downtown.

Steubenville, Ohio has three major roadways that run through and along the perimeter of the town. State Route 7 runs along the Ohio River and is intersected by State Route 43 that runs through Steubenville and connects to Wintersville. From Weirton, State Route 7 is also intersected by State Route 22.

Considering that the downtown is the main focus for this thesis, it is important to note that there is a large opening in the downtown area that is not covered by Steubenville’s "tree canopy". Mainly due to the topography of Steubenville, the "tree canopy" can only be found covering many areas uptown and along the ridge of the Ohio River.

Historic Settlement Analysis

1885 First settlement at the flat land on the margins of the Ohio River in a rectangular grid pattern.

1913 Growth expanded West of downtown.

1929 The natural environment and topography influenced growth to occur in a linear manner. Pockets of residential development occurred where reasonable flat ground could be assembled.

1954 Development along Sunset Boulevard continues to grow and create commercial nodes to serve the neighborhoods.

2016 Currently, the downtown is divided into four districts: The Historic Residential District, the Business District, the Commercial/ Light Industrial District, and the Residential District.
DOWNTOWN SECTIONS

Market Street Bridge Section
60' 100' 200'

Downtown Section
700 800 900 1000
AREA OF STUDY

- Streetscapes
- Downtown Hub
- Riverfront
URBAN DESIGN PROCESS
NOTE: Images in color outlined in teal represent buildings of historic significance. Images in black and white signify buildings of no historic significance.
NOTE: Images in color outlined in teal represent buildings of historic significance. Images in black and white signify buildings of no historic significance.
FALL SEMESTER REVIEW
November 28, 2016 (Final Review)

Proposed Main Focuses

Proposed Infill Plan: Phase 1

Proposed Infill Plan: Phase 2
Non Significant Historic Buildings vs. Historically Significant

Existing Land-use
Proposed Nodes with Functions

Proposed Nodes with New Civic Plaza

Proposed Market Street Master Plan
Massing & Edge Studies

Preliminary Massing Sketch
KEVIN LYNCH: THE IMAGE OF THE CITY
“[…] This city is in itself the powerful symbol of a complex society. If visually well set forth, it can also have strong expressive meaning... The common hopes and pleasures, the sense of community may be made flesh. Above all, if the environment is visibly organized and sharply identified, then the citizen can inform it with his own meanings and connections. Then it will become a true place, remarkable and unmistakable”.

OVERALL GOALS:
- Why Steubenville?
- Why Market Street?
- Bring back the historic and economic vibrance
- Bring people back to downtown

IMPORTANCE OF THE CITY/DOWNTOWN:
- Why is the downtown important in bringing back the economic integrity of the city?

THE VISION OF MARKET STREET:
- Restore and preserve the historic character to bring about a new sense of vibrance within the downtown.
- Create a new urban context in downtown.
- Promote community interaction with updated and safe streetscapes.
- Encourage diverse uses to promote community amenities (such as retail, restaurants, residential etc.)
- Promote civic amenities.
- Develop downtown as a label for Steubenville.
- Encourage architecture that responds to community needs as well as enforces urban activities.
- Promote urban residential uses.
- Promote mixed-use development.
- Celebrate downtown Steubenville.

SITE DESIGN:
- Enforce walkable blocks.
- Active retail and commercial functions along street level buildings.
- Enhance pedestrian experiences.

STREETS/SIDEWALKS:
- Create a safe mix of vehicles and pedestrian circulation.
- Create bulb-outs for parking for vehicles and pedestrian amenities (seating).
- Reinforce pedestrian activity and walkability.
- Create key transit stops.
- Enhance existing streetscapes.
- Utilize part of sidewalk for outdoor seating and foliage for cafes and restaurants at street level (5’ public/private zone).
- Create crosswalks and important intersections.
- Continuous foliage (street trees) along the sidewalk edge.
- Incorporate historic lighting elements that are aesthetically pleasing and also create ample lighting for pedestrians and vehicles.
- Incorporate historic signage elements.
- Enhance public interaction with buildings by inviting storefronts.

PARKING LOTS:
- Incorporate screening along street frontages.
- Incorporate interior parking lot lighting for vehicles and pedestrians.
- Incorporate interior parking lot landscape to reduce heat island effect.
- Plant selection should be of native species.

BUILDINGS:
- Hold building edge line.
- Represent historic character in new developments
- Promote mixed-use development to promote diverse amenities for the community.
URBAN DESIGN GUIDELINES [CONTINUED]

Sketches
FINAL DESIGN AND PRESENTATION
A Different Type of Resilience:
A Paradigm Shift for Small Post-Industrial Communities

Economic adversity has impacted a wide range of post-industrial cities throughout the Northeast and Great Lakes Region. Steubenville, Ohio, a mid-sized, former manufacturing hub must seek to empower the use of its natural assets (through urban, master planning, and architectural design) as a catalyst for new growth and economic resilience that will serve as a transformative paradigm shift for the community.

Terri Lynn Wolfe
2017 M. ARCH II Candidate Architectural Masters Thesis
**Transportation**
Transportation is a crucial part of the urban design analysis. Studying 'micro' travel movements help to assess traffic patterns within a specific area. This assessment also helps to establish proposed linkages as well as future needs.

**Open Space**
An open space analysis illustrates the spaces which are unoccupied and have the opportunity to be developed in the future.

**Existing Street Patterns**
A figure ground of the framework of the city streets identifies existing streets. This assessment helps to understand the existing street grid and orientation as it relates to the entirety of the city.

**Block Patterns**
A block pattern analysis is used as an assessment to study the block coverage of a specific site or area as solid masses as opposed to the voids of the streets.

**Fragmented Patterns**
A fragmented, or inverted, building figure ground analysis is a way to perceive positive space within the city and its existing blocks.

**Urban Diagrams**
- Market Street as Hierarchy of Downtown
- Irregular Natural River Edge vs. Regular City Edge
- Linear Transformation of River Edge
- Proposed Steuben Center Site
- Proposed Continuous Urban Edge
- Proposed Continuous Urban Edge with New Growth Edge
- Combined New Growth Edge with Linear River Edge

**Urban Framework**
Washington Street
Market Street
Dean Martin Blvd
North 4th Street
North 7th Street
North 3rd Street
A thorough analysis of the existing context of Market Street was conducted in order to understand how this street can be re-invented into the thriving street that it once was back in the 1950s. Currently, there are many vacant lots and old dilapidated buildings that are located along Market Street. One of the goals of the urban plan for Market Street is to revitalize the buildings that once served as a historic significance to the downtown. Many of these historic buildings are unoccupied and are in need of new mix-used programs to take over these vacant spaces. Another goal for the urban plan is to create a densified mixed-use Market Street through two phases. Both of these phases combined create density through infill tactics, promote walkability for pedestrians as well as vehicular access, and recreates the identity of what Market Street used to be.
**URBAN INFILL**

Phase 1 and 2

# Market Street

**Urban Master Plan**

- **PROPOSED INFILL**
- **PROPOSED PARKING**
- **SIGNIFICANT INTERSECTIONS**

## [Phase 1]

- **PROPOSED INFILL**
- **PROPOSED PARKING**
- **PROPOSED CITY PLAZA**
- **SIGNIFICANT INTERSECTIONS**

## [Phase 2]

**STREET/SIDEWALK DETAILS**

- Existing Market Street
- Proposed Urban Infill

**Proposed Steuben Center Site**
THE STEUBEN CENTER

Floor Plans

1. Plaza Entrance Promenade
2. Upper Plaza
2a. +2'-0" Upper Walkway
3. Lower Plaza
4. Garden Atrium
5. Jefferson County Post Office
6. Ground Floor Cafe's
7. Ground Floor Retail
8. +2'-0" Retail
9. +2'-0" Cafe's
10. Men & Women Public Restrooms
11. Youth Recreation Center
12. Community Room

PARKING GARAGE / LOWER PLAZA

1. Parking Garage
2. Elevator/Stair Cores
3. Lower Plaza
4. Creative Arts Center
4a. Loading
5. Men & Women Public Restrooms

SITE DIAGRAMS

Re-activate N. 3rd Court House Entrance
Site Edge Influence
Lower Plaza Future Expansion
Plaza Path Connectors
1. Commercial Space
2. High-End Restaurant
2a. Exterior Eating Terrace
2b. Exterior Bar Terrace
3. Garden Atrium

SECOND FLOOR

THIRD - FOURTH FLOOR
THE STEUBEN CENTER
Exploded Site Axonometric
Existing Market Street context

NOTE: Buildings with an X on them signify that they will eventually be demolished during phasing.

Market Street Phase 1 Implementation

Market Street Phase 2 Implementation
Urban Plan Street Connectors

Proposed River Park Plaza

Perpendicular Street Connectors

Street Connector Extensions to residential hillside

Visual Connectors from site to river plaza

Continuous riverwalk
DEDICATION:

This thesis is dedicated to the M. ARCH class of 2017 (aka my buddies). I would not have been able to get through these past 2 years without each and every one of you. Being in Oxford with you guys has been the best time of my life and I could not be more blessed to have been surrounded by a better bunch of goofballs. I will forever cherish the memories that we have all made together and hope that these friendships will last a lifetime I wish you all the very best of luck in your bright futures.